

---

# TOPOLOGY PROCEEDINGS



Volume 40, 2012

Pages 189–194

---

<http://topology.auburn.edu/tp/>

## CHARACTERIZATIONS OF TERMINAL SUBCONTINUA

by

BENJAMIN ESPINOZA AND LIKIN C. SIMON ROMERO

Electronically published on August 25, 2011

---

### Topology Proceedings

**Web:** <http://topology.auburn.edu/tp/>

**Mail:** Topology Proceedings  
Department of Mathematics & Statistics  
Auburn University, Alabama 36849, USA

**E-mail:** [topolog@auburn.edu](mailto:topolog@auburn.edu)

**ISSN:** 0146-4124

COPYRIGHT © by Topology Proceedings. All rights reserved.

## CHARACTERIZATIONS OF TERMINAL SUBCONTINUA

BENJAMIN ESPINOZA AND LIKIN C. SIMON ROMERO

**ABSTRACT.** In 1942, J. L. Kelley proved that if  $X$  is a Kelley continuum then  $C(X)$  is contractible. In the proof, the author defines several set-valued functions. In 1991, Alejandro Illanes introduced the concept of semi-boundary. In this paper, we use the notion of semi-boundary, as well as the set-valued functions defined by Kelley to characterize terminal subcontinua of a given continuum.

### 1. INTRODUCTION AND PRELIMINARY RESULTS

A *continuum* is a compact connected metric space. The letter  $X$  will denote a continuum with a metric  $d$ . A *map* is a continuous function.

The symbol  $C(X)$  denotes the hyperspace of subcontinua of  $X$  equipped with the Hausdorff metric [5, Definition 2.1]. The letter  $\mu$  will denote a Whitney map for  $C(X)$ . Whitney maps will be considered to be normalized, that is  $\mu : C(X) \rightarrow I$ , where  $I$  denotes the unit interval  $[0, 1]$ , and  $\mu(X) = 1$ . The set  $\mu^{-1}(t)$  will be called a *Whitney level*; throughout this paper we will consider only Whitney levels for which  $t < 1$ .

A continuum  $X$  is a *Kelley continuum* if for every  $x \in X$ , each sequence  $\{x_n\} \subset X$  such that  $x_n \rightarrow x$ , and for every  $K \in C(X)$  with  $x \in K$  there exists a sequence of continua  $K_n \in C(X)$  with  $x_n \in K_n$  such that  $K_n \rightarrow K$ . This class of continua was first introduced by J. L. Kelley in 1942 [6]. Kelley defines the following special functions.

Given a Whitney map  $\mu : C(X) \rightarrow I$ , let  $F : X \times I \rightarrow C(C(X))$  and  $G : X \times I \rightarrow C(X)$  be the functions defined, for  $(x, t) \in X \times I$ , by

$$F(x, t) = \{K \in \mu^{-1}(t) : x \in K\}$$

---

2010 *Mathematics Subject Classification.* Primary 54F15, 54B20; Secondary 54C60.

*Key words and phrases.* Continua, hyperspace of subcontinua, Kelley functions, semi-boundary, terminal continua.

©2011 Topology Proceedings.

and

$$G(x, t) = \bigcup F(x, t).$$

Similarly, let  $\mathcal{F} : C(X) \times I \rightarrow C(C(X))$  and  $\mathcal{G} : C(X) \times I \rightarrow C(X)$  be as follows:

$$\mathcal{F}(A, t) = \bigcup \{F(x, s) : x \in A \text{ and } s \leq t\}$$

and

$$\mathcal{G}(A, t) = \bigcup \{G(x, s) : x \in A \text{ and } s \leq t\}.$$

Kelley proves that if  $X$  is a Kelley continuum, then  $C(X)$  is contractible [6, Theorem 3.3].

Define  $H : X \times I \rightarrow C(X)$  by

$$H(x, t) = G(x, \inf \{s \in I : G(x, s) \in \mu^{-1}(t)\}).$$

Włodzimierz J. Charatonik [3] defines a natural extension of Kelley's function  $F$ . The function  $F^* : C(X) \times I \rightarrow C(C(X))$  is defined, for  $(A, t) \in C(X) \times I$ , by

$$F^*(A, t) = \begin{cases} \{A\} & \text{if } t \leq \mu(A); \\ \{K \in \mu^{-1}(t) : A \subset K\} & \text{if } t \geq \mu(A). \end{cases}$$

An extension of the function  $G$  is defined by Gerardo Acosta [1] as follows

$$G^*(A, t) = \begin{cases} A & \text{if } t \leq \mu(A); \\ \bigcup F^*(A, t) & \text{if } t \geq \mu(A). \end{cases}$$

Note that  $G^* : C(X) \times I \rightarrow C(X)$ .

We refer to the functions  $F$ ,  $G$ ,  $\mathcal{F}$ ,  $\mathcal{G}$ ,  $H$ ,  $F^*$ , and  $G^*$  as *Kelley functions*. It is known that Kelley functions are continuous in Kelley continua.

Alejandro Illanes [4] introduced the concept of semi-boundary. Let  $A$  be a proper subcontinuum of  $X$ . The *semi-boundary* of  $C(A)$ , denoted by  $SB(A)$ , is the set of all subcontinua  $B$  of  $A$  such that there is a continuous function  $\alpha : I \rightarrow C(X)$  such that  $\alpha(0) = B$  and  $\alpha(t) \not\subset A$  for all  $t > 0$ .

**Theorem 1.1** ([4, Theorem 1.2]). *Let  $A$  be a proper subcontinuum of  $X$ . Then the following statements hold.*

- (1)  $B \in SB(A)$  if and only if  $B \in C(A)$  and there exists a map  $\alpha : I \rightarrow C(X)$  such that  $\alpha(0) = B$ ,  $\alpha(t)$  is not contained in  $A$  for each  $t > 0$ , and if  $s < t$ , then  $\alpha(s) \subset \alpha(t)$ .
- (2)  $A \in SB(A)$ .
- (3) If  $B, D \in C(X)$ ,  $B \cap D \neq \emptyset$ ,  $B \setminus D \neq \emptyset$ ,  $D \setminus B \neq \emptyset$ , and  $E$  is a component of  $B \cap D$ , then  $E \in SB(B) \cap SB(D)$ .

**Remark 1.2.** Observe that the map  $\alpha$  in (1) can be taken such that  $\alpha(1) = X$  [5, Theorem 14.6].

The purpose of this paper is to characterize terminal subcontinua (defined in §2) in terms of some Kelley functions and the semi-boundaries of such subcontinua. The main result is presented in §2.

In order to prove the main theorem, we will need the next three propositions.

Let  $K$  be a subcontinuum of  $X$  such that  $K \in F(x, s)$  for some  $(x, s) \in X \times I$ . It is well known that for every  $t \in I$  such that  $s \leq t$ , there is a subcontinuum  $L$  of  $X$  such that  $K \subset L$  and  $L \in F(x, t)$  [5, Theorem 14.6]. Then, by the definitions of the functions  $F$  and  $G$ , the following propositions follow.

**Proposition 1.3.** *If  $x \in X$  and  $s \leq t$ , then  $G(x, s) \subset G(x, t)$ . And if  $G(x, s) \subsetneq G(x, t)$ , then  $s < t$ .*

The hypothesis on the second part of the previous proposition is necessary, for if  $X$  is  $S^1$ ,  $\mu : C(X) \rightarrow I$  is the arc-length,  $s = 3\pi/2$ , and  $t = \pi$ , we have that  $G(x, s) = G(x, t)$  for every  $x$  in  $S^1$  but  $s > t$ .

**Proposition 1.4.** *Let  $x \in X$ . Then  $t_1 \leq t_2$  if and only if  $H(x, t_1) \subset H(x, t_2)$ .*

*Proof.* For the case of equalities, the equivalence follows from the definition of  $H$ .

Let

$$s_1 = \inf \{ s \in I : G(x, s) \in \mu^{-1}(t_1) \}$$

and

$$s_2 = \inf \{ s \in I : G(x, s) \in \mu^{-1}(t_2) \}.$$

Then

$$t_1 = \mu(G(x, s_1)) \text{ and } \mu(G(x, s_2)) = t_2.$$

Therefore, by the definition of  $H$  and Proposition 1.3, we have  $t_1 < t_2$  if and only if  $H(x, t_1) \subsetneq H(x, t_2)$ .  $\square$

The next proposition can also be obtained directly from the definitions.

**Proposition 1.5.** *Let  $A$  be a subcontinuum of  $X$ , let  $a \in A$ , and let  $t \geq \mu(A)$ . Then  $F^*(A, t) \subset F(a, t)$ .*

## 2. MAIN RESULTS

Let  $A$  be a proper subcontinuum of  $X$ . We say that  $A$  is *terminal* in  $X$  if for any subcontinuum  $B$  of  $X$  such that  $A \cap B \neq \emptyset$ , either  $A \subset B$  or  $B \subset A$ .

According to the following result, the terminality of a continuum can be characterized in terms of the Kelley functions and also by its semi-boundary.

**Theorem 2.1.** *If  $A$  is a proper subcontinuum of  $X$ , then the following statements are equivalent.*

- (1)  $A$  is terminal in  $X$ .
- (2)  $\mathcal{F}(A, \mu(A)) \subset C(A)$ .
- (3) For every  $a \in A$ ,  $F(a, \mu(A)) = \{A\}$ .
- (4)  $\mathcal{G}(A, \mu(A)) = A$ .
- (5) For every  $a \in A$ ,  $G(a, \mu(A)) = A$ .
- (6)  $SB(A) = \{A\}$ .

*Proof.* Assume (1) and assume that (2) does not hold. By the definition of the function  $\mathcal{F}$ , there is  $a \in A$  and  $t \leq \mu(A)$  such that  $F(a, t) \not\subset C(A)$ . Then there is  $B \in \mu^{-1}(t)$  such that  $a \in B$  and  $B \not\subset A$ . Thus,  $A \cap B \neq \emptyset$ . Since  $A \neq B$  and  $t \leq \mu(A)$ , we get  $A \not\subset B$ . Hence,  $A$  is not terminal. This shows that (1) implies (2).

Suppose that (2) holds. Let  $a \in A$  and  $B \in F(a, \mu(A))$ . Then  $B \in \mathcal{F}(A, \mu(A))$ ; so, by (2),  $B \subset A$ . Since  $\mu(B) = \mu(A)$ , this implies that  $B = A$ . Thus, (3) holds. Therefore, (2) implies (3).

Let us assume (3). Let  $a \in A$ , let  $t \leq \mu(A)$ , and let  $B \in F(a, t)$ . Then there is a subcontinuum  $A'$  such that  $B \subset A'$  and  $\mu(A') = \mu(A)$ . It follows that  $A' \in F(a, \mu(A))$ . Using (3), we can conclude that  $A' = A$ . Hence, for every  $B \in F(a, t)$ , we have that  $B \subset A$ . Thus,  $G(a, t) \subset A$  for every  $a \in A$  and each  $t \leq \mu(A)$ . Consequently,  $\mathcal{G}(A, \mu(A)) \subset A$ . Note that by the definition of the function  $\mathcal{G}$ , we have  $A \subset \mathcal{G}(A, \mu(A))$ . This shows that (4) follows from (3).

In order to prove that (4) implies (5), let  $a \in A$ . Since  $A \in F(a, \mu(A))$ , we have that  $A \subset G(a, \mu(A))$ . Let  $x \in G(a, \mu(A))$ . Then there is a subcontinuum  $B \in F(a, \mu(A))$  such that  $x \in B$ . Thus,  $B \subset G(a, \mu(A))$ . From  $G(a, \mu(A)) \subset \mathcal{G}(A, \mu(A))$ , we get that  $B \subset \mathcal{G}(A, \mu(A))$ . Hence, using (4),  $B \subset A$ . In particular,  $x \in A$ . It follows that  $G(a, \mu(A)) = A$ . Therefore, (4) implies (5).

Assume (5) and assume that statement (6) does not hold. Then there is  $B \in SB(A)$  such that  $B \neq A$ . Then  $\mu(B) < \mu(A)$ . By Theorem 1.1(1) and Remark 1.2, there is a map  $\alpha : I \rightarrow C(X)$  such that  $\alpha(0) = B$ ;  $\alpha(t)$  is not contained in  $A$  for each  $t > 0$ ; if  $s < t$ , then  $\alpha(s) \subset \alpha(t)$ ; and  $\alpha(1) = X$ . Hence, there is  $t_0 > 0$  such that, if  $\alpha(t_0) = A'$ , then  $\mu(A') = \mu(A)$ . From the definition of  $\alpha$ , we have that  $B \subset A'$  and  $A \neq A'$ . By the definition of the function  $G$ , we get  $A' \subset G(a, \mu(A))$ . This contradicts (5).

The implication that (6) implies (1) is a consequence from Theorem 3.7 in [2].  $\square$

Note that (2) of Theorem 2.1 can be replaced by an equality. Thus,  $A$  is a terminal subcontinuum of  $A$  if and only if  $\mathcal{F}(A, \mu(A)) = C(A)$ .

**Corollary 2.2.** *If  $A$  is a terminal subcontinuum of  $X$ , then for every  $(a, t) \in A \times [0, \mu(A)]$ ,  $H(a, t) \subset A$ .*

*Proof.* Let  $a \in A$ . If  $A$  is terminal, by Theorem 2.1,  $G(a, \mu(A)) = A$ . Hence,  $\mu(G(a, \mu(A))) = \mu(A)$ . On the other hand,  $H(a, \mu(A)) = G(a, \inf \{s \in I : G(a, s) \in \mu^{-1}(\mu(A))\})$ . Let

$$s_0 = \inf \{s \in I : G(a, s) \in \mu^{-1}(\mu(A))\}.$$

Then  $s_0 \leq \mu(A)$ . Therefore, by Proposition 1.3,  $H(a, \mu(A)) = G(a, s_0) \subset G(a, \mu(A)) = A$ . Since  $H(a, t) \subset H(a, \mu(A))$ , by Proposition 1.4, we have that  $H(a, t) \subset A$ .  $\square$

**Theorem 2.3.** *If  $A$  is a proper subcontinuum of  $X$ , then the following statements are equivalent.*

- (1)  $A$  is terminal in  $X$ .
- (2) For every  $a \in A$  and  $t \geq \mu(A)$ ,  $F(a, t) = F^*(A, t)$ .
- (3) For every  $a \in A$  and  $t \geq \mu(A)$ ,  $G(a, t) = G^*(A, t)$ .

*Proof.* Assume that  $A$  is a terminal in  $X$ . Let  $t \geq \mu(A)$ . By Proposition 1.5,  $F^*(A, t) \subset F(a, t)$ .

Let  $(a, t) \in A \times [\mu(A), 1]$  and let  $K \in F(a, t)$ . Since  $a \in A \cap K$  and  $A$  is terminal, either  $A \subset K$  or  $K \subset A$ . Since  $t \geq \mu(A)$ , it follows that  $A \subset K$ , so  $K \in F^*(A, t)$ . Thus,  $F(a, t) \subset F^*(A, t)$ . It follows that  $F(a, t) = F^*(A, t)$ . Therefore, (1) implies (2).

If (2) holds, then for every  $a \in A$  and  $t \geq \mu(A)$ ,

$$G(a, t) = \bigcup F(a, t) = \bigcup F^*(A, t) = G^*(A, t).$$

Thus, (3) holds.

Assume that (3) holds. In particular, we have that for every  $a \in A$ ,  $G(a, \mu(A)) = G^*(A, \mu(A)) = A$ . By Theorem 2.1,  $A$  is terminal. This finishes the proof.  $\square$

## REFERENCES

- [1] Gerardo Acosta Garcia, *Hiperespacios y la Propiedad de Kelley*. Tesis de Licenciatura en Matemáticas Aplicadas, Universidad Autónoma de Coahuila, México, 1994.
- [2] ———, *Homogeneous circle-like continua are  $C$ -determined*, *Topology Proc.* **30** (2006), no. 1, 1–23.
- [3] Włodzimierz J. Charatonik, *On the property of Kelley in hyperspaces*, in *Topology (Leningrad, 1982)*. Ed. Ludwig D. Faddeev and Arkadii A. Mal'cev. Lecture Notes in Mathematics 1060. Berlin: Springer, 1984. 7–10.

- [4] Alejandro Illanes, *Semi-boundaries in hyperspaces*, Topology Proc. **16** (1991), 63–87.
- [5] Alejandro Illanes and Sam B. Nadler, Jr., *Hyperspaces. Fundamentals and Recent Advances*. Monographs and Textbooks in Pure and Applied Mathematics, 216. New York: Marcel Dekker, Inc., 1999.
- [6] J. L. Kelley, *Hyperspaces of a continuum*, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. **52** (1942), 22–36.
- [7] Sam B. Nadler, Jr., *Hyperspaces of Sets. A Text with Research Questions*. Monographs and Textbooks in Pure and Applied Mathematics, 49. New York-Basel: Marcel Dekker, Inc., 1978.

(Espinoza) DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS; UNIVERSITY OF PITTSBURGH AT GREENSBURG; 136 FACULTY OFFICE BUILDING; 150 FINOLI DRIVE; GREENSBURG, PA 15601  
*E-mail address:* `bee1@pitt.edu`

(Simon Romero) SCHOOL OF MATHEMATICAL SCIENCES; ROCHESTER INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY; 85 LOMB MEMORIAL DRIVE; ROCHESTER, NY 14623  
*E-mail address:* `lsrsma@rit.edu`